

## COMMITTEE REPORT

**Date:** 18 October 2012      **Ward:** Guildhall  
**Team:** Major and      **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel  
Commercial Team

**Reference:** 12/02508/FUL  
**Application at:** York City Art Gallery Exhibition Square York YO1 2EW  
**For:** First floor extension above south gallery, rear extension including first floor balcony and external stair, roof-mounted plant and enclosure and demolition of single storey timber building to north side of building.  
**By:** Mr Michael Woodward  
**Application Type:** Full Application  
**Target Date:** 26 October 2012  
**Recommendation:** Approve

### 1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 Planning permission is sought for the following alterations and works to the Art Gallery -

- A first floor extension above the south gallery (on the south-western side of the building) externally clad in white, beige, blue and green coloured triangular panelling.
- The addition of a balcony and external stair at the rear screened/enclosed by vertical larch timbers.
- Restoration of the north elevation following the demolition/removal of the single storey timber structure on this side of the building.
- Plant located on the roof, toward the rear of the building, with a surrounding brick wall to screen it from view.

1.2 There is a companion application for listed building consent 12/02509/LBC.

### 2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area  
Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core

Listed Buildings:

- Grade 2; Railings And Gates Fronting Kings Manor 0618
- Grade 2; City Art Gallery Exhibition Square York 0615
- Grade1; City Walls St Mary's Tower To Bootham Tower
- Grade 1; St Mary's Tower St Mary's Abbey Remains

Scheduled Ancient Monuments GMS Constraints: SMR 12A St Mary's Abbey Precinct Walls SE 597520

## 2.2 Policies:

CYGP1 Design  
 CYHE3 Conservation Areas  
 CYHE4 Listed Buildings  
 CYHE10 Archaeology

## 3.0 CONSULTATIONS

### Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development

3.1 Officers support the proposals, and consider the scheme would enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area, particularly to the side and rear of the gallery where the scale and detail of the two imaginative additions would contribute to York's architectural legacy. Important views from Exhibition Square would be unchanged. Views from within the gardens would be enhanced and new relationships would be created between the gallery and its garden context.

### Flood Risk Management

3.2 No objections.

### Guildhall Planning Panel

3.3 Object to the geometrical designs, which clash with the curves and arches of the building. Concern of the use of colour on the external cladding as this cannot be fully understood from the plans available.

### Publicity

3.4 Deadline for comments 10/10/2012. No written representations have been made to date.

## English Heritage

3.5 No response to date, any comments will be reported verbally.

## **4.0 APPRAISAL**

### 4.1 Key Issues

- Impact on the listed building, the setting of surrounded listed buildings, and on the character and appearance of the conservation area
- Amenity of surrounding occupants

### Visual impact

4.2 Design policies within the National Planning Policy Framework advise that proposals should be supported when developments will:

- function well and add to the overall quality of the area
- respond to local character and history, and reflect the identity of local surroundings and materials, while not preventing or discouraging appropriate innovation;
- are visually attractive

4.3 The National Planning Policy Framework also advises that planning should not attempt to impose architectural styles or particular tastes and they should not stifle innovation, originality or initiative through unsubstantiated requirements to conform to certain development forms or styles and significant weight should be given to outstanding or innovative designs which help raise the standard of design.

4.4 The host building is grade 2 listed and within the Central Historic Core Conservation Area. CABE and English Heritage publication: Building in Context which offers guidance on proposals in such areas advises a successful approach will:

- Relate well to the geography and history of the place and the lie of the land
- Sit happily in the pattern of existing development and routes through and around it
- Respect important views
- Respect the scale of neighbouring buildings
- Use materials and building methods which are as high in quality as those used in existing buildings
- Create new views and juxtapositions which add to the variety and texture of the setting.

4.5 In considering the impact on the listed building, the National Planning Policy Framework advises that Local planning authorities should identify and assess the significance of the part of the building affected by a proposal. They should consider the impact of a proposal on a heritage asset, and avoid or minimise conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal. The NPPF recognises that buildings may need to change over time in the interests of their long-term viability. In determining applications the NPPF advises that it is desirable to sustain and enhance the significance of heritage assets and put them to viable uses consistent with their conservation, and to encourage new development which makes a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

4.6 The proposed works are required to provide extra gallery space, improve circulation through the building and access to the gardens at the rear of the building and to enhance the building's appearance. External plant is proposed as the gallery are required by the Arts Council to achieve certain environmental performance standards. It is proposed the external plant is located on the roof and screened with a brick wall. In addition internal changes are proposed, which form part of the companion listed building consent application.

4.7 The two extensions (south side and rear) have been conceived to appear as contemporary interventions, distinguishable from the original fabric. This approach is welcome and follows English Heritage principles.

#### South gallery extension

4.8 The volume and shape of the extension above the south gallery will mean the extension is subordinate to the main building, situated between the front and rear buildings and below the main roof. The cladding panels will reference the pottery centre that will be accommodated within the building and would compliment the copper roof on the front of the existing building. The extension would connect elegantly to the existing fabric. PV panels located on the roof would be hidden from view. The extension would be viewed directly from the car park behind King's Manor, otherwise it would only be seen in indirect views and would be partially screened by trees. By virtue of the location, proposed scale and materials, the extension will be a discreet addition to the building. The extension is of appropriate design and would add to the interest of the host building.

4.9 Although the extension would result in the loss of the original roof, only the internal cast iron roof trusses are of historic interest. However similar roof trusses would remain exposed in the north gallery. The benefits the extension would bring, increasing floor-space within the gallery and enhancing the external appearance of the building, outweigh the limited harm caused by the loss of historic fabric.

## Rear extension

4.10 At the rear of the building it is proposed to add an external stair and first floor terrace from which the garden can be enjoyed. The structure would be clad with a series of vertically laid timbers of varying finishes too add interest, which would conceal the stair and provide an integrated balcony to the terrace. The enclosure would extend 4.5m from rear elevation and extend up to first floor level. The rear block of the building was added in the 1940's/50's. The building currently fails to relate/connect to the space behind and the exterior is unattractive. The proposed works will to an extent rectify the aforementioned issues and constitute a significant improvement to the appearance of the host building and how it functions.

## Plant screen

4.11 The plant would be enclosed by a brick wall that would surround the rear block, adding around 2.2m to its height. The rear block would remain slightly lower than the front facade and there would be limited visual impact from the oblique and reasonably distant views in which the rear of the building can be seen from within the public realm. Presently some plant is bolted onto the rear elevation of the building at low level. The plant screen would keep external plant out of sight, which is welcome, and the brick enclosure would be sympathetic to the building due to its scale and materials.

## Demolition of timber building on the north side

4.12 The proposals include the removal of the single storey timber building to the north side of the art gallery. The structure detracts from the appearance of the building and its removal is not objected to. Bins would be stored in this area (they are presently stored at this side of the building but closer to Exhibition Square). Provided the design of the enclosure is acceptable the proposed arrangement will improve the setting by hiding the bins from view.

## Amenity of surrounding occupants

4.13 The National Planning Policy Framework requires that developments secure a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.

4.14 The proposed extensions would not have an adverse effect on neighbours. The first floor extension would be to the northern side of King's Manor and would not therefore overshadow the proposed building or lead to a loss of light. The rear windows on King's Manor overlook the car-park rather than the gallery building, as such and due to the subordinate scale of the side extension it would not be over-dominant or over-bearing. The rear extension, due to its location, would have no impact on its neighbours.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 The proposals are welcomed. The works will significantly improve the appearance of and facilities within the City Art Gallery. The architecture is of good quality and will enhance the appearance of the host building and how it connects with the garden behind. The works will also increase the floor-space within the gallery by 50% and enable it to accommodate a National Centre for British Studio Pottery.

5.2 In accordance with national policy the proposals will enhance the viability and significance of the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area, bring economic and community benefits and have no adverse impact on amenity. Approval is recommended subject to no objections being received from English Heritage. Conditions are required to cover the external appearance and archaeology.

## COMMITTEE TO VISIT

**6.0 RECOMMENDATION:** Delegated Authority to Approve subject to receipt of no objections from English Heritage

1 TIME2 Development start within three years

2 List of approved plans

Site plan:

156-A-DGA-PLA-0200 REV P02

Floor plans:

156-A-DGA-PLA-0500 P07

156-A-DGA-PLA-0501 P11

156-A-DGA-PLA-0502 P11

Roof plan:

156-A-DGA-PLA-0503 P09

Elevations:

156-A-DGA-ELE-0701 P07

156-A-DGA-ELE-0702 P06

3 Samples of the external materials, including a comprehensive sample of the timber cladding and ceramic tiles/cladding to be used shall be submitted to and

approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to construction of the extensions. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance in the interests of the appearance of the listed building.

4 Prior to completion of the development hereby approved a detailed hard landscaping scheme which shall cover the external areas to the north and west sides of the building shall be approved by the Local Planning Authority and the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. The scheme shall include surfacing materials, any planting, railings and fencing and external lighting.

Reason: To preserve the setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

5 Prior to completion of the development hereby approved details of the enclosure to the bin store (proposed on the north side of the building) shall be approved by the Local Planning Authority and the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. Bins shall be stored in the approved enclosure at all times unless alternative provision is approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To preserve the setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

6 ARCH2 Watching brief required

7 Details of all machinery, plant and equipment to be installed which is audible outside of the site boundary, when in use, shall be submitted to the local planning authority for approval prior to its first use. These details shall include maximum (L<sub>Amax</sub>(f)) and average sound levels (L<sub>Aeq</sub>), octave band noise levels and any proposed noise mitigation measures. All such machinery, plant or equipment and any noise mitigation measures shall be fully implemented and operational in accordance with the approved details prior to first use and appropriately maintained thereafter.

Reason: In the interests of the amenity of nearby occupants in accordance with policy GP1 of the City of York Draft Local Plan.

## **7.0 INFORMATIVES:**

### **Notes to Applicant**

#### 1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the impact on heritage assets and the amenity of surrounding occupants. As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1, HE3, HE4, and HE10 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan.

**Contact details:**

**Author:** Jonathan Kenyon Development Management Officer

**Tel No:** 01904 551323